

ANNUAL REPORT 1



21 March 2019, Dodoma - Tanzania

REPORT OF THE FIRST MULTI-STAKEHOLDER CONFERENCE ON BUSINESS AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN TANZANIA



Annual report 1

“Report of the first multi-stakeholder conference on Business and Human Rights in Tanzania”

Conference held on the 21st of March 2019 in Dodoma, Tanzania

Antwerp/Dodoma, March, 2020

Report prepared by:

Commission for Human Rights and Good Governance

P. O. Box 1039, DODOMA, Tanzania

Tel: +255 734 047 775 Fax: +255 22 2111533/2135226

Email: info@chragg.go.tz

Website: www.chragg.go.tz

Layout: Sakado

Edited by IPIS (Mieke Thierens)

D/2020/4320/2



**Project
funded by the
EUROPEAN UNION**

This publication is part of the 'Improving monitoring, research and dialogue on Business & Human Rights in Tanzania' project implemented by the Tanzanian Commission for Human Rights and Good Governance (CHRAGG), Business and Human Rights Tanzania (BHRT) and the International Peace Information Service (IPIS), with the financial support of the European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights (EIDHR).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	4
1. INTRODUCTION	6
2. OBJECTIVE OF THE CONFERENCE.....	6
3. OPENING REMARKS.....	6
4. METHODOLOGIES.....	7
5. PAPER PRESENTATIONS	7
5.1. International Frameworks on Business and Human Rights	7
5.2. Context Analysis of Business and Human Rights in Tanzania	7
5.3. Case studies into Business and Human Rights in Tanzania	8
5.3.1. <i>Labour Rights and Access to Remedies in Fish Processing Industries in Mwanza City.....</i>	<i>9</i>
5.3.2. <i>Labour Rights Compliance in the Cut Flower Industry at Mount Meru, Arusha</i>	<i>10</i>
5.3.3. <i>Human Rights Issues to Watch in the Construction of the East African Crude Oil Pipeline.....</i>	<i>10</i>
5.3.4. <i>Limestone mining and human rights issues in Kigoma Region.....</i>	<i>11</i>
5.3.5. <i>Tourism Investment and Land Rights: Case of Uvinje Village, Saadani National Park</i>	<i>12</i>
6. MATTERS ARISING FROM PLENARY DISCUSSIONS	13
7. HEMATIC AND SECTORAL GROUP DISCUSSION.....	14
7.1. Factors for Choosing a Priority Theme	14
7.1.1. <i>Group 'A': Land Matters.....</i>	<i>14</i>
7.1.2. <i>Group 'B': Labour Matters.....</i>	<i>14</i>
7.1.3. <i>Group 'C': Tax Regime.....</i>	<i>15</i>
7.1.4. <i>Group 'D': Environment.....</i>	<i>15</i>
8. CHOICE OF THE ANNUAL THEME.....	15
9. CONCLUSIONS AND WAYFORWARD	15

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The multi-stakeholders' conference was held on 21 March, 2019 in Dodoma-Tanzania. The conference's objectives were to raise awareness, build trust and strengthen the national multi-stakeholder networks for advancing the agenda on Business and Human Rights (B&HR) in Tanzania. The conference was attended by participants from the government, civil society organizations and business corporates from both Tanzania Mainland and Tanzania Zanzibar. Other participants were experts from the European Union External Action Services (EAAS), the United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund (UNICEF) and project technical team from IPIS, BHRT and CHRAGG.

The conference was conducted in various sessions covering opening remarks, presentations, discussions, conclusion and the way forward. The conference was inaugurated by Ms. Fatuma Idd Muya, CHRAGG's Acting Executive Secretary. In her opening remarks, she focused on the need to broaden business and human rights dialogues with regard to corporates' activities; joint stakeholders' efforts and continued collaboration on the B&HR agenda in Tanzania.

The first presentation on **International Frameworks on Business and Human Rights** focused on the relationships that exist between business and human rights in the value chain and the available frameworks. A reflection was made on stakeholders' responsibility on addressing the three United Nations Guiding Principles on B&HR (UNGP) pillars namely: the State's duty to protect against human rights abuses; the corporate responsibility to respect human rights and access to effective remedies by victims of business related human rights abuses.

The second presentation was on the **Context Analysis of Business and Human Rights in Tanzania**. This presentation familiarised the participants with key issues and findings in the CHRAGG's **Tanzania National Baseline Assessment on Business and Human Rights (NBA)**. It was noted that the context analysis was a continuous process and the roadmap towards development and adoption of the National Action Plan on Business and Human Rights (NAP-BHR). The process of preparing the NAP-BHR depends on the completion of Tanzania's National Human Rights Action Plan, which will likely consider the findings of the NBA and updates of the context analysis on B&HR. It was also highlighted that updates on the contextual situation considered comments made during the bilateral stakeholder meetings held in August and December 2018. Similarly, it considered the inclusion of the findings of B&HR case studies on labour rights in the fish processing industries in Mwanza; the cut flower industry in Arusha; human rights issues in the construction of East African Crude Oil Pipeline; forest conservation and limestone mining in Kigoma, and tourism investment and land rights at Saadani National Park. It was finally noted that the context analysis covers government initiatives, legal frameworks and policies and gaps in the implementation of the UNGPs in the Extractives (mining, oil and gas); Tourism; Agribusiness; Manufacturing and Processing industries and Infrastructure and Goods sectors. This also included other relevant thematic areas: labour matters; environmental management; land ownership and acquisition; gender issues; bilateral investment; access to information; public service delivery; government's commitment to the UNGPs, corporate law and tax law as well as effective mechanisms for handling grievances.

Five case studies on current issues of B&HR, published as "Voices from Tanzania", were also presented during the meeting.

The first case presented by CHRAGG was on **Labour Rights and Access to Remedies in Fish Processing Industries in Mwanza** at three industries of Nile Perch Fisheries Limited, Omega Fish Limited and Tanzania Fish Processors Limited. The objectives of the studies were to find out the extent to which workers in the fishing industries had access to available non-judicial grievance mechanisms, industries compliance with labour standards, and employees' knowledge in labour rights. The main findings of this study included: unawareness of the BHR concept; protection of employees welfare were below the required standards; industries adhered to International and national standards on fish exports; there was emphasis on safe and clean, hygienic working condition; company level grievances handling mechanism were trusted by employees than the state base mechanisms; failure by the Occupational Safety and

Health Authority (OSHA) and the Labour Inspectorate to fully address labour issues due to being under-resourced; insufficient knowledge on availability of state-based non-judicial grievance mechanisms; and fishing industry employees were paid minimum salary was said to be not a living wage in Tanzania; and insecurity of tenure of casual labourers. It was finally recommended that the government, through its relevant institutions, should create awareness of labour standards and strengthen technical and financial capacity to enable institutions like OSHA and the Office of Labour Commissioner to effectively execute their mandates.

The second case study, presented by BHRT, was on **Labour Rights Compliance in the Cut Flower Industry in Mount Meru, Arusha Region**. This study aimed at finding out labour rights compliance status. Key findings were: knowledge gap on labour rights by 80 percent of employees; low sectoral minimum wage payment of Tanzania Shilling (Tsh) 100,000 compared with other sectors; generally guaranteed safety and health conditions; and workers were not unionized.

The third case study on **Human Rights Issues to Watch in the Construction of the East African Crude Oil Pipeline (EACOP)** was presented by Governance Links. This study aimed at pointing out human rights issues in the EACOP construction project. The issues highlighted included consideration of rights on: employment and labour; land use; access to justice, education and technology; workers and local communities' engagement; cultural and environmental rights. The study recommended for the government to protect human rights and promote stakeholders' dialogues; CHRAGG and CSOs to assume their oversight role; and consideration of rights and needs of special groups.

IPIS presented the fourth case study on **Limestone Mining and Human Rights Issues in Kigoma Region**. This study investigated the conflicting relations between mining communities and conservation authorities in Makere Forest Reserve. It was found out that: limestone mining in Makere Forest Reserve resulted into deforestation; evident miners' resistance against/unawareness of enforcement of mining and mining laws; use of excessive force by forest authorities, as well as corruption and illegal taxation; and involvement of and poor working conditions of DRC and Burundi refugees. The study recommended capacity building, and mining and forest laws alignment by the Ministry of Mining and forests authorities.

LHRC presented the fifth case study on **Tourism Investment and Land rights: Case of Uvinje Village, Saadani National Park** focusing on the land dispute between some of Uvinje's communities and the Saadani National Park. The study's key findings included: Uvinje villagers were not fully consulted during the establishment of Saadani National Park; Tanzania National Park Authority (TANAPA) did not consider the findings of the Environmental and Social Impact Assessments when it established Saadani National Park and CHRAGG's recommendations on the dispute were not complied with. The study recommended the engagement and collaboration of local communities, ministries responsible for land natural resources and tourism; and compliance with CHRAGG's recommendations.

Moreover, reflections were made on the presentations during plenary discussions and group works. Some issues raised during plenary discussions included the need for: broadening the definition of vulnerability to include victims of business-related human rights abuses; broadening the scope of case studies conducted; and strategizing on stakeholders' engagement across various sectors to address relevant issues on their rights and obligations.

During group discussions key 'business and human rights' challenges and priorities were identified in the areas of 'labour', 'land', 'environment management' and 'tax regime'. The discussions also came up with the theme "**Land Rights in relation to Environment Management**" as the annual priority topic for the year 2019.

Finally, participants recommended steps to be taken. These were the multi-stakeholder dialogue's **recommendations for the way forward**. They included increasing stakeholders' awareness and engagement on Business and Human Rights; increased involvement of small-scale investors, local communities and vulnerable groups in B&HR dialogues; and updating CHRAGG's B&HR stakeholders' database.

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1. This report presents a summary of the outcomes of the conference titled “Multi Stakeholder Conference on Business and Human Rights” which was held in Dodoma, Tanzania on 21st March, 2019, at Royal Village Hotel. The conference was part of the project: **“Improving, monitoring, research and dialogue on business and human rights in Tanzania”**, which aims at building local and national capacities for improved reporting, fact finding, monitoring and follow-up of corporate activities in Tanzania.
- 1.2. The CHRAGG is executing the project in partnership with the International Peace Information Service (IPIS), a Belgium based International Non-Governmental Organization (NGO), and Business and Human Rights Tanzania (BHRT), a local Tanzanian NGO.
- 1.3. The one-day conference brought together over 65 participants from government, civil society organizations and the business/corporate community from Tanzania Zanzibar and Tanzania Mainland. Close to half of the participants (45%) were female. The Government was represented by 20/65 (36%) participants, ten (18%) participants were from businesses and 14 (25%) from Tanzanian civil society organizations. Also attending the conference were experts from the EU EAAS, UNICEF, and the project technical implementation team CHRAGG, IPIS and BHRT.
- 1.4. The purpose of the conference was to raise awareness, build trust and strengthen the national multi-stakeholder network for advancing the agenda on Business and Human Rights (B&HR) in Tanzania. The conference had a specific goal to select a B&HR annual theme that would be a central focus in the EU-funded project *“Improving, monitoring, research and dialogue on Business and Human Rights in Tanzania”* for the year 2019. During the conference and after a broad discussion ‘*Land Rights and Environment*’ was identified as priority theme for 2019.
- 1.5. The conference provided a forum for the experts and participants to increase awareness of national and international B&HR frameworks and to share experiences and learning on addressing adverse human rights impacts caused by business activities, in particular those in the extractives sector, agricultural sectors, manufacturing industries and tourism.

2. OBJECTIVE OF THE CONFERENCE

The specific objectives of the conference were to create awareness about the EU project so that representatives from key stakeholder groups could be conversant with the project objectives and activities, and contribute to the expected outcomes of the project; promote awareness on relevant (inter-) national B&HR frameworks; and improve the national context analysis of B&HR as well as to discuss the current state of protection of human rights in relation to business activities in Tanzania.

3. OPENING REMARKS

The Conference was inaugurated by Ms. Fatuma Muya, the CHRAGG Acting Executive Secretary and closed by Mr. Francis Nzuki, the Director of Complains and Investigation Division at the CHRAGG.

In her opening remarks Ms Fatuma Muya, informed the participants on the necessity of broadening dialogues on human rights issues related to corporates’ activities. In order to move forward, joint efforts by different stakeholders were needed, including the business community. She also called for continued collaboration to advance the agenda of B&HR in Tanzania with a focus on the implementation UNGPs.

4. METHODOLOGIES

The conference was conducted in a participatory approach through plenary discussion, question and answer sessions and group works. Four plenary presentations were given. The findings of five scoping studies on B&HR (*“Voices from Tanzania”*), conducted by the three project partners (CHRAGG, IPIS and BHRT), as well as two CSOs: (LHRC) and Government Links Tanzania), were presented and discussed. Other presentations were on the context analysis of B&HR in Tanzania, on introducing the EU-funded project *“Improving, monitoring, research and dialogue on business and human rights in Tanzania”* and on key B&HR Frameworks, such as the UNGPs. Working groups on *labour matters, tax regime, and environmental management and land rights* were formed for discussing most pressing corporate human rights issues in the country and, eventually the choice of the Year 2019 Annual Theme.

5. PAPER PRESENTATIONS

The presentations aimed at familiarizing participants with the key concepts and international frameworks on B&HR and the current state of protection of human rights in relation to business activities in Tanzania. The presentation of the five *“Voices from Tanzania”* shared recent case studies on *labour rights issues in the fish processing and cut flower industries* of Mwanza and Arusha respectively, the relation between *tourism investment and land rights* in Sadaani National Park, *forest conservation and limestone mining* in Kigoma Region and human rights issues to watch in *the construction of the East African Crude Oil Pipeline*. Narration of specific issues is provided.



5.1. International Frameworks on Business and Human Rights

Participants were familiarized with the B&HR agenda, and the background and context of the United Nations Guiding Principles on Business and Human rights (UNGPs)¹. The presenter focused on the relationship between business and human rights in the value chain and the frameworks available. A reflection on why business and human rights should be an agenda was discussed by addressing the responsibility of each stakeholder involved in the dialogue, guided by the three pillars of the UNGPs: the State’s duty to protect, the corporate responsibility to respect and the access to Effective remedy to victims of human rights violations.

5.2. Context Analysis of Business and Human Rights in Tanzania

An overview and update of the context analysis of the Business and Human Rights context in Tanzania were presented. The main objective was to familiarise the participants with the key issues and gaps identified by the Tanzania National Baseline Assessment on Business and Human Rights (NBA)² conducted by the CHRAGG and launched on 9th November, 2017.

1 Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights: Implementing the United Nations ‘Protect, Respect and Remedy’ Framework | Office of the High Commission on Human Rights (OHCHR) | 2011. https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/GuidingPrinciplesBusinessHR_EN.pdf

2 National Baseline Assessment (NBA) of current implementation of business and human rights frameworks in the United Republic of Tanzania | CHRAGG, DIHR & SOMO | November 2017. https://www.business-humanrights.org/sites/default/files/documents/Tanzania%20BHR%20NBA_FINAL_Nov2017.pdf

The context analysis is a continuous process and the road map to the preparation and adoption of the National Action Plan on Business and Human Rights (NAP-BHR). The initiation of the process of preparing the NAP-BHR depended on the completion of the revision of the National Human Rights Action Plan (2013-2017), which its life span lapsed in December, 2017. The revision would more likely consider the inclusion of some of the findings of the NBA and updates of the context analysis on B&HR.

Since 2018, CHRAGG, BHRT and IPIS had conducted activities that update some of the contextual situation of B&HR as part of the implementation of the project: *“Improving Monitoring, Research and Dialogue on Business and Human Rights in Tanzania”*. This update took into consideration the;

1. Comments of the bilateral meeting with business stakeholders held on the 3rd of December, 2018 at CHRAGG’s head office in Dar es Salaam;
2. Comments from the meeting of Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) held on the 13th of August 2018 by BHRT in Dar es Salaam;
3. Findings of B&HR case studies on labour rights in the fish processing industries in Mwanza City and the cut flower industry in Arusha Region, human rights issues in the construction of East African Crude Oil Pipeline and forest conservation and limestone mining in Kigoma Region, as well as tourism investment and land rights at Saadani National Park (see 5.3).

Based on the lists of efforts in place, the context analysis generally presented government initiatives, legal frameworks and policies and gaps in the implementation of the UNGPs in the five key sectors of Extractives (mining, oil and gas); Tourism; Agribusiness; Manufacturing and Processing Industries and Infrastructure and Goods. However, key transversal themes such as labour matters, environmental management, land ownership and acquisition, gender issues, bilateral investment, access to information, public service delivery, government commitment to the UNGPs, corporate and tax laws (including revenue collection) and effective grievance mechanisms still needed to be addressed.

5.3. Case studies into Business and Human Rights in Tanzania

The findings of five **“Voices from Tanzania”**³ case studies conducted on labour issues, tourism, human rights impacts caused by the construction of Eastern Africa pipeline and on limestone mining were presented. CHRAGG and BHRT presented their studies on Labour Rights in Fish Processing Industries in Mwanza City and Cut Flower Agribusiness in Arusha region. IPIS presented findings on Limestone Mining Communities in Kigoma, while Governance Links presented their analysis of Human Rights Issues to Watch in the Construction of East African Crude Oil Pipeline (EACOP) that stretches from Tanga Port in Tanzania to Hoima in Uganda. The LHRC briefed on the findings of Tourism Investment and Land Rights, the Case of Saadani National Park that is located along the coast of the Indian Ocean in Tanzania’s Coastal Region.

5.3.1. Labour Rights and Access to Remedies in Fish Processing Industries in Mwanza City

The CHRAGG conducted the study from 7th to 12th October, 2018 in three fish processing industries of Nile Perch Fisheries Limited; Omega Fish Limited and Tanzania Fish Processors Limited in the Mwanza City. The study aimed at ascertaining the extent to which workers in the fishing industries had access to available non-judicial grievance mechanisms, to oversee compliance with labour standards, to establish the knowledge gap of employers and employees regarding to labour rights and to advise on remedial actions.

3 Voices from Tanzania – Case studies on Business and Human Rights| BHRT, CHRAGG, Governance Links, IPIS & Legal and Human Rights Centre | 03.2019. <http://ipisresearch.be/publication/voices-tanzania-case-studies-business-human-rights-vol-1/>

The findings of the study were:-

1. Employers and workers were not aware of the concept of “Business and Human Rights”;
2. The welfare of employees seemed generally well-protected, though not always to the standards required by the law;
3. All industries adhered to National and International standards on export and emphasized on safe and clean, hygienic working environment;
4. The company-level grievance handling mechanisms were active, strong, effective, reliable and trusted by employees, more than the state-based mechanisms;
5. State-based non-judicial grievance mechanisms and especially the Labour Inspectorate and OSHA were under-resourced and therefore could not fully execute their mandates;
6. Insufficient knowledge on access to available state-based non-judicial grievance mechanisms and enforcement procedures and limited knowledge on labour rights and labour rights standards were evident;
7. Employees complained of minimum salary that was not a living wage in Tanzania;
8. Most workers in the fish processing industries were casual workers with short-term insecure employment conditions.



The study recommends:

1. The Government (through responsible ministries) in collaboration with CHRAGG and other human rights stakeholders to create awareness on business and human rights to industries’ workers and management about available non-judicial mechanisms;
2. The Government (through responsible ministries) to strengthen financial and human capacity of non-judicial grievance mechanisms;
3. Effective measures be taken to oversee social security schemes and employers;
4. Government (through responsible institutions) to review the Labour Institution Wage Order 2013 (GN No. 196/2013) that regulates the current minimum wages;
5. The Office of the Labour Commissioner and OSHA to effectively use their mandates to ensure adherence to labour rights and standards by both employees and employers and take stern measures when breaches occur.

5.3.2. Labour Rights Compliance in the Cut Flower Industry at Mount Meru, Arusha

This study by BHRT aimed at collecting information on the status of labour rights compliance in the cut flower industry, a case of Mount Meru Flower Farm in Arusha Region, North-east Tanzania. The study assessed the awareness on labour laws, policies and rights of employers and employees; the compliance with labour standards by employers and companies in the floriculture industry and general human rights awareness amongst employers and employees in this industry.

The findings showed:-

1. Over 80% of the workers had a knowledge gap in labour laws and policies;
2. The majority of the workers (78%) in the cut flower industry at Mount Meru had employment contracts drawn in Swahili (i.e. easy to read and understand by most employees);
3. The majority of workers were paid a sectoral minimum wage salary of Tsh 100,000 per month, which was below the wage in the Trade, Industry and Commercial Sector (Tsh 150,000), the Fishing and Marine Sector (Tsh 200,000) and the Communication Sector (Tsh 150,000);
4. Working conditions in the cut flower industry were generally good; health and safety were generally guaranteed, although workers were not supplied with safety gears/information to be protected against toxic pesticides;
5. Most workers were not unionized, while trade unions were seen as helpful to employees.



5.3.3. Human Rights Issues to Watch in the Construction of the East African Crude Oil Pipeline

This study by Governance Links aimed at providing a basis for highlighting salient human rights issues to be observed by companies in the course of the construction of the East African Crude Oil Pipeline (EACOP).

The EACOP will be the longest electrically heated pipeline in the world and will transport crude oil from Kabaale Parish in Hoima District of Uganda to the Chogoleani peninsula near Tanga port in Tanzania, about 1,445 km further. The Tanzanian section of the pipeline, covering 1,149 km, will cross 8 regions and at least 25 districts in northern Tanzania. This includes both densely populated areas (e.g. Kagera, Geita, Shinyanga and Tanga Regions) as well as regions now dedicated to cultivation and/or grazing (e.g. in Tabora, Tanga and Shinyanga Regions). The \$3.55 billion project will be managed and implemented by state-owned Tanzania Petroleum Development Corporation (TPDC) and International companies:

Total, Tullow Oil Plc and the Chinese National Overseas Oil Corporation (CNOOC).



Such large infrastructure projects related to energy or transportation are one of the business sectors in Tanzania where human rights concerns have been raised. Problematic areas could be the acquisition of project land, as it might require internal displacement of communities from their land, compensation, resettlement and complex processes of community engagement in general.

The study identified the following human rights issues as critical to watch:

1. Employment conditions, safety and labour standards in general due to multiple employers with varying experiences;
2. Land-related rights;
3. Access to justice, education and technology;
4. Adequate standard of living due to anticipated displacement and resettlement of communities;
5. Workplace dialogue, community and worker engagement and consultation;
6. Cultural rights of (indigenous) communities;
7. Rights related to the environment.

The study recommends:

1. Communities to be involved in all stages of the project from planning to assessment of risks and impacts and to be availed with all necessary information about the project;
2. The Government to perform its duty to protect human rights and businesses to respect human rights;
3. CHRAGG to perform its oversight mandate and civil societies to be involved as well;
4. The Government to provide space for multi-stakeholder dialogues with companies, communities and civil society organizations;
5. The implementation of the project to consider the special needs of marginalized groups like women, children and people with disabilities.

5.3.4. Limestone mining and human rights issues in Kigoma Region

The study by IPIS investigated the tensions between limestone mining communities and conservation authorities in the Makere Forest Reserve, Kigoma Region. In and around the Makere Forest Reserve - one of the 448 National Forest Reserves in Tanzania - 64 limestone mining and processing sites have been identified. Over 600 workers were estimated to be employed in the Makere limestone mining sector. Many others find indirect employment including limestone traders, lime kiln builders, transporters, brick makers and food providers. Where Makere communities relied heavily on land and resources in the forest reserve for their livelihood, forest authorities were mandated with enforcing laws and regulations that discourage human activities in such reserves.



The study found:

1. The biggest impact of limestone mining on Makere Forest Reserve was deforestation, due to consumption of large amounts of firewood needed for limestone mining;
2. Both violent and passive resistance of miners existed, due to the ill-aligned enforcement of forest and mining laws and due to the diffused responsibilities between mandated authorities;
3. Use of excessive force is used by forest authorities during the expulsion of the miners from the Reserve, resulting in physical harm and illegal seizure and confiscation of property;

4. Reported corruption and illegal taxation by forest officials;
5. Reported cases of Burundi and DRC refugees from the Nyarugusu Camp being involved in mining under poor working conditions. Foreign workers who work without working permit have also been observed.

The study recommends:

1. Stakeholders, including the Ministry of Mining, to build capacities and provide training to miners on compliance with mining and forest laws and regulations ;
2. Mining and forest authorities should align the enforcement of their mandates so that a balance is found between natural resource extraction and forest conservation.

5.3.5. Tourism Investment and Land Rights: Case of Uvinje Village, Saadani National Park

The LHRC study focused on the land dispute between communities of Uvinje Village and forest authorities of Saadani National Park. The conflict had persisted since 1990s when Saadani National Park was established for tourism investment. In the process Uvinje Village land was considered public land by authorities, in contrast to villagers’ perspectives. Since then, villagers were required to vacate from the reserved lands of Saadani National Park.



Key findings were:

1. Land rights of Uvinje villagers were not considered during the establishment of Saadani National Park;
2. Due diligence was not exercised: Tanzania National Park Authority (TANAPA) did not consider the findings of Environmental and Social Impacts Assessments during the establishment of Saadani National Park;
3. The recommendations by the CHRAGG on the land dispute and related human rights issues had not been complied with by relevant authorities;

The study recommends:

1. The engagement of the communities in tourism investment and their participation in decision-making processes;
2. the CHRAGG monitor implementation of its recommendations;
3. The Ministries of Land and Housing and the Natural Resources and Tourism to collaborate to solve the land dispute;
4. The Government and Civil Society Organizations to actively take part in advocating for community rights and the concept of free, prior and informed consent.

6. MATTERS ARISING FROM PLENARY DISCUSSIONS

SN.	MATTERS ARISING	RESPONSE	ACTION
1	The operational definition of vulnerability should be broadened not only to include women, children and people with disability, but to all victims of B&HR-related violations. It should include all who cannot defend or protect themselves against such violations, like employees against employers, communities against multinational investors;	It was agreed that all victims of corporate harms qualified to be vulnerable	CHRAGG, BHRT and other stakeholders including Government, Business and CSOs to continue advocating for protection, respect and remedy of human rights
2	Strategize on the means of engaging stakeholders from a broad spectrum of sectors and themes impacted by business and human rights;	All project activities should be implemented through broad engagement and consultation with stakeholders.	CHRAGG to update the database of the stakeholders regularly.
3	The weaknesses of implementing and enforcing labour laws that are clear, centres around human resources personnel who have no regulatory professional bodies to oversee their professional and career standards as was the case of engineers, doctors, lawyers, teachers, nurses;	Weakness in implementing and enforcing laws is enlarged by inadequate awareness on human rights and legal education. In Tanzania there are Professional Monitoring Bodies in almost all cadres.	CHRAGG and other stakeholders to conduct human rights and legal education to law enforcers and Profession Monitoring Bodies.
4	Wages/Salaries of the private sector are set by the Sectoral Wage Board without offering incremental wage increases resulting from experience, performance or education level;	Salaries/Wages should be able to cater for human basic needs in conformity with the current standards of living.	Engage the Labour Commission/ Minister responsible for Labour to initiate Review of salaries of the private sectors
5	Concerns raised about the sample size of the population interviewed in the five studies of the "Voices from Tanzania". Are these large enough to be representative of the studied populations? Do these allow reliable and realistic findings?	"Voices from Tanzania" studies are designed to be small scoping studies, to raise awareness on B&HR issues as experienced on the ground. Though sampling sizes were small, the findings represent concerns covering major issues of B&HR in the country as also found by the NBA.	Next "Voices from Tanzania" studies will continue to bring to the surface issues of B&HR in the country through small, field-based scoping studies. CHRAGG, BHRT and IPIS will strategize on how to best use these studies for advocacy and awareness raising.
6	In the scope of the study on Fish Processing Industries in Mwanza ("Voices from Tanzania" study by CHRAGG) it would have been interesting to include the entire fish supply chain, like fishermen and markets, etc;	Study aimed at assessing adherence to labour rights and standards in Fish Processing Industries only.	Where resources are available, CHRAGG will broaden its study to include supply chain analyses
7	CHRAGG's recommendations on the Uvinje land dispute ("Voices from Tanzania" study by LHRC) have not been complied with ;	The reviewed recommendations required authorities to pay compensation.	CHRAGG will continue to monitor the implementation of its recommendations.
8	The role of trade unions in collective bargaining and follow up of employees' rights is unclear and the unions are weak to perform their legal obligations;	Mandate and functions of Trade Unions are provided by laws, therefore they should work within the ambit of the laws.	CHRAGG and other stakeholders to hold regular dialogues with Trade Unions to advocate for full implementation of their mandates and functions as provided by the laws.

SN.	MATTERS ARISING	RESPONSE	ACTION
9	National and International labour standards should be harmonised for smooth and productive implementation of the UNGPs;	Tanzania Labour Laws conform with International labour standards save for few provisions which need to be reviewed, e.g. Provisions which allow a child under 18 years old to be employed in certain kinds of job	Advocate for review of laws to conform to international standards.
10	Stakeholders are ignorant of their rights and duties in investment procedures, especially regarding procedures on land acquisition;	There is inadequate awareness of Investment and Land laws	CHRAGG and other stakeholders to continue to create awareness of Investment and Land Laws
11	The Context analysis does not include Judicial Grievance Handling Mechanisms in Tanzania Zanzibar	The structure of the Court System of Zanzibar is similar to that of Tanzania Mainland	In future updates, the context analysis will include and mention the Zanzibar Court System.

7. THEMATIC AND SECTORAL GROUP DISCUSSION

The main objective of this working group work was to identify and discuss priority topics and actions according to different sectors/stakeholders. Four participant groups were formed to discuss key B&HR issues and to select an annual theme to focus in 2019. The themes were: land matters; labour matters; tax regimes and environmental management. The sectors that were to be aligned with the aforementioned sectors were agri-business, extractive industries, infrastructure, tourism and manufacturing industries. In this session representatives from each working group presented the proposed priorities for action on the theme discussed in their groups to the plenary.



7.1. Factors for Choosing a Priority Theme

7.1.1. Group' A': Land Matters

1. This is a transversal theme as land is part of all economic activities;
2. Most violent conflicts are related to the mismanagement of lands or disputes over land use (rights);
3. There is a need for dialogue on the harmonisation of laws beyond land laws. There are, e.g., conflicting laws governing surface rights and sub-surface rights;

7.1.2. Group' B': Labour Matters

1. There are proven awareness, knowledge and implementation gaps on labour rights and standards;
2. Labour rights are a transversal theme, cutting across all sectors (agriculture, resource extraction, tourism, infrastructure, manufacturing);

7.1.3. Group 'C': Tax Regime

There is multiplication of revenue collection and administration institutions/agencies. This complexity has negative effects on investment in the country and hence, needs national dialogue and research to move forward.

7.1.4. Group 'D': Environment

1. Environment forms the basis for all life;
2. The environment impacts the right to life, health, property, etc; and is therefore a cross-cutting issue when discussing human rights;
3. The Government's drive to industrialisation needs proper management of the environment.

8. CHOICE OF THE ANNUAL THEME

Participants have deliberately chosen "**Land Rights in Relation to Environment management**" to be the priority topic for further action in the year 2019.

9. CONCLUSIONS AND WAYFORWARD

Throughout the conference's presentations, plenary discussions and group works, the stakeholders from the government, civil society organisations and Tanzania's business community engaged in much-needed dialogue on the status, priorities and way forward for Business and Human Rights in Tanzania.

Participants raised issues such as inadequate coherence, monitoring and enforcement of existing legislation, the cross-cutting nature of topics such as land, environment and gender in safeguarding human rights and the absolute need for increased awareness on the topic of Business and Human Rights. At the end of a fruitful day of exchanges and debate, '**land rights and environment**' emerged as the priority topic to focus on in the next year of the project: "**Improving monitoring, research and dialogue on Business and Human Rights in Tanzania**", implemented by the CHRAGG, BHRT and IPIS.

Overall, this first national multi-stakeholder dialogue on Business and Human Rights was evaluated positively and a must to repeat, preferably as a multi-day event and with even a larger group of stakeholders included.

To move the national agenda on Business and Human Rights forward, these steps are considered essential:

For all stakeholders, to increase their awareness on Business and Human Rights and to promote and advocate for Business and Human Rights;

For small-scale investors and stakeholders in fishing, mining, business and farming, as well as local communities and vulnerable groups, to be more engaged in the Business and Human Rights dialogue;

For CHRAGG, to update its database of its stakeholders and to continue engaging them, as well as promoting Business and Human Rights.

Annual report 1 is produced in the framework of the project *"Improving monitoring, research and dialogue on Business and Human Rights in Tanzania"*, as implemented by the Tanzanian Commission for Human Rights and Good Governance (CHRAGG), Business and Human Rights Tanzania (BHRT) and the International Peace Information Service (IPIS), with the financial support of the European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights (EIDHR).



Project
funded by the
EUROPEAN UNION

